



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13

2. “It will be based on freedom...”: Freedom from Without and Within

Freedom – Herut

הגדה של פסח

הא לחמא עניא, דאכלו אבהתנא בארעא דמצריים. כל דכפין, ייתי ויכול; וכל דצריך ייתי ויפסח.

השתא הכא, לשנה הבאה בארעא דישראל; השתא עבדי, לשתא הבאה בני חורין.

שמות, ל"ב; ט"ו-ט"ז
 טו ויפן ויגד משה, מן-ההר, ושני לוחת העדת, בגדו: לוחת, כתבים משני עבריהם-
 מנה ומנה, הם כתבים. טז והלחת--מעשה אלהים, המה; והמכתב, מכתב
 אלהים הוא--חרות, על-הלחת.

Exodus 32:15-16

15 And Moses turned, and went down from the mount, with the two tables of the testimony in his hand; tables that were written on both their sides; on the one side and on the other were they written. 16 And the tables were the work of God, and the writing was the writing of God, graven upon the tables.

Passover Haggadah – Ha Lachma Anya

This is the bread of poverty and persecution that our ancestors ate in the land of Egypt...

LET ALL who are hungry, come and eat

LET ALL who are in need, come and share the Pesach meal.

THIS YEAR we are still here – Next year, in the land of Israel.

THIS YEAR we are still slaves –

Next year, **free** people.

תהא מושתתה על יסודות
 החירות, הצדק והשלום לאור
 חזנם של נביאי ישראל;
 ...it will be based on
freedom, justice and peace
 as envisaged by the prophets
 of Israel;

Mishna Avot 6:2

Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi would say... ‘And the tablets were the work of God and the writing was the writing of God, which was engraved on the tablets.’ [Exod. 32:16] Don’t read ‘engraved’ [charut] but rather [read] ‘**freedom**’ [cherut], for only the individual who is engaged in the study of the Torah is [truly] **free**...

- ❖ Why does the text from the Passover Haggadah assume that this year, meaning every year, we are *still* slaves?
- ❖ Do you agree that we are? If so, what are your reasons?
- ❖ Can you think of any connections between the words “freedom” and “graven”, both of which are written the same in Hebrew - ה-ר-ו-ת?
- ❖ Are the Ten Commandments (which represent all the commandments in Judaism) a system that is meant only to limit, or does it have additional purposes?
- ❖ Why do you think Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi makes the connection between Torah study and freedom in the context of the giving of the Ten Commandments?





Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13

2. “It will be based on freedom...”: Freedom from Without and Within

HaRav Kook, *Olat Re'iah* (commentary on the prayer book) – Liberty (Herut)

The difference between the slave and the **freeman** is not one of status, in that the former is subjugated to another and the latter is not. We can find an educated slave whose spirit is filled with liberty, and conversely a **freeman** whose spirit is that of a slave. Liberty of character is that soaring spirit that lifts the individual, and indeed the entire people, to be faithful to its inner self; the psychological character of the Divine image within him, and such a character enables him to sense his life as a purposeful one befitting of its value. Not so the man who has a spirit of slavery, the content of whose life and whose emotions are never illuminated by the character of his own soul, but by what is considered good and fine by another who controls him in some manner, whether officially or morally – by what the other finds to be good and fine...

... תהא מושתתה על יסודות **החירות**,
 הצדק והשלום לאור חזונם של נביאי
 ישראל;
 ... it will be based on **freedom**,
 justice and peace as envisaged by
 the prophets of Israel;

- ❖ What definitions of freedom in these texts speak to you most?
- ❖ Who is really free? (The wealthy person who lives in isolation, the married person with multiple family obligations, those who take upon themselves the obligation of the commandments, those who believe they are not beholden to anyone or anything...)
- ❖ Do you have to experience a limit on your freedom in order to truly appreciate it?
- ❖ Do you believe it is really possible to develop and maintain a sense of freedom if you are enslaved in some way?

Amos Oz, *Under This Blazing Light: Essays*, translated by Nicholas de Lange, Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge, 1995 p. 15

One day in London, in the thick of a smog, when you could not see your hand in front of your face, a man summoned by phone to a hospital at the other end of town where his child was seriously ill.

The man opened his front door and stood in the murky darkness, calling out for help, but there were no cars, no passers by. Suddenly a hand landed on his shoulder and a voice said, ‘I’ll take you.’ And the stranger did indeed lead the anxious father right across London, unfalteringly, saying confidently from time to time ‘turn left here’, ‘mind the steps’, ‘careful, there’s a ramp’.

When they reached the hospital the man asked the stranger how he could possibly find his way through such a dense fog. ‘Darkness and fog do not bother me,’ the other replied, ‘because I am blind.’

© Amos Oz 1979, English translation first published 1995 by Cambridge University Press

חירות

מילון בן יהודה :

1. כמו חופש, מעמד אדם חופשי בן חורין.
2. זכות מיוחדת נתונה לאדם לעשות דבר מה, במסחר וכדומה.
3. זכות מיוחדת בכלל מהממשלה בעניין ציבורי.

מילון אבן שושן : חופש, דרור, מעמדו של אדם חופשי.

מילון רב מילים : חופש, עצמאות, היכולת של אדם או של עם

Liberty (Herut)

Ben Yehuda Dictionary:

1. Free, the status of a free person.
2. A special right granted to a person to perform some act, in commerce, etc.
3. A special right granted by the government on a public matter.

Even Shoshan Dictionary:

Freedom, the status of a free person.

Rav Milim Dictionary:

Freedom, independence, the ability of an individual or a people to act independently in accordance with their will.



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13

2. “It will be based on freedom...”: Freedom from Without and Within

Freedom – Hofesh

שמות, כ"א; ב'

כי תקנה עבד עברי שש שנים יעבד ובשבעת יצא לחפשי חנם.

Exodus 21:2

Thou buy a Hebrew servant, six years he shall serve; and in the seventh he shall go out **free** for nothing.

- ❖ Why do you think that a Hebrew servant is automatically entitled to release after six years of service?
- ❖ Is this person then truly free?

תהא מושתתה על יסודות החירות, הצדק והשלום לאור חזונו של נביאי ישראל;
 it will be based on **freedom**, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel;

Universal Declaration of Human Rights, December 10, 1948

Whereas recognition of the inherent dignity and of the equal and inalienable rights of all members of the human family is the foundation of **freedom**, justice and peace in the world, All human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights... Everyone is entitled to all the rights and freedoms set forth in this Declaration, without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status. Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person... Everyone has the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion...

Everyone has the right to freedom of opinion and expression...

- ❖ The Universal Declaration of Human Rights says that the foundation of freedom is the “recognition of the inherent dignity and the equal and inalienable rights of all members of the human family”. Do you find it hard to recognize the dignity and equality of all people? If so, why? If not, why not? Why do you think that this is difficult for some people? (This may be a hard question to answer honestly!)
- ❖ Do you agree that with freedom comes the obligation to ensure that others are freed?
- ❖ If so, to what extent are you obligated?

עבד' זמן

רבי יהודה הלוי

עבדי זמן עבדי עבדים הם –
 עבד אדני הוא לבד חפשי!
 על-כן בבקש כל-אנוש חלקו –
 חלקי אדני, אמרה נפשי.

Servants of Time / Rabbi Yehuda Halevy

The servants of time are slaves of slaves.

The servant of God – he alone is **free**!

Therefore, when each man demands his portion, “My portion is God,” says my soul.

- ❖ What does it mean to be a servant of time?
- ❖ Are you a servant of time? In what ways?
- ❖ What does it mean to say “My portion is God”? How do you relate personally to this statement?

Shiri Lev-Ari, “Memory Instead of Revenge,” interview with Tony Morrison, *Ha’aretz*, 11 April 2004

Question: Does every social struggle for one group of people inevitably harm another group of people?

Morrison: “This is a symptom of all social struggles – you campaign and win, but then what? What you need to do after you win is to help someone else. That’s the meaning of **freedom**. You win **freedom** so you can make sure others enjoy **freedom**. It’s easy to be obsessed with power, wealth, status, and possessions. The trick is how to remain a decent person despite all the temptations, and how to help those who are next in line.”



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13

2. "It will be based on freedom...": Freedom from Without and Within

Freedom – Dror

Leviticus 25:10

And you shall hallow the fiftieth year, and proclaim liberty throughout the land unto all the inhabitants thereof; it shall be a jubilee unto you; and you shall return every man unto his possession, and you shall return every man unto his family.

Jeremiah 34:8-17

8 The word that came unto Jeremiah from the LORD, after that the king Zedekiah had made a covenant with all the people that were at Jerusalem, to proclaim liberty unto them; 9 that every man should let his manservant, and every man his maidservant, being a Hebrew man or a Hebrew woman, go free; that none should make bondmen of them, even of a Jew his brother; 10 and all the princes and all the people hearkened, that had entered into the covenant to let every one his man-servant, and every one his maid-servant, go free, and not to make bondmen of them any more; they hearkened, and let them go; 11 but afterwards they turned, and caused the servants and the handmaids, whom they had let go free, to return, and brought them into subjection for servants and for handmaids; 12 therefore the word of the LORD came to Jeremiah from the LORD, saying: 13 Thus says the LORD, the God of Israel: I made a covenant with your fathers in the day that I brought them forth out of the land of Egypt, out of the house of bondage, saying: 14 'At the end of seven years you shall let go every man his brother that is a Hebrew, that has been sold unto you, and has served you six years, you shall let him go free from thee'; but your fathers hearkened not unto Me, neither inclined their ear. 15 And you were now turned, and had done that which is right in Mine eyes, in proclaiming liberty every man to his neighbor; and you had made a covenant before Me in the house whereon My name is called; 16 but you turned and profaned My name, and caused every man his servant, and every man his handmaid, whom you had let go free at their pleasure, to return; and you brought them into subjection, to be unto you for servants and for handmaids. 17 Therefore thus saith the LORD: You have not hearkened unto Me, to proclaim liberty, every man to his brother, and every man to his neighbor; behold, I proclaim for you a liberty, says the LORD, unto the sword, unto the pestilence, and unto the famine; and I will make you a horror unto all the kingdoms of the earth.

ויקרא, כ"ה; י'

וקדשׁתם את שנת החמשים שנה וקראתם דרור בארץ לכל ישיבה יובל הוא תהיה לכם ושבתם איש אל אחוזתו ואיש אל משפחתו תשבּו:

- ❖ According to Biblical law, every person was to receive his land back (most recipients were men with few exceptions) in the jubilee (fiftieth) year. In this way, the original land allotment between the tribes of Israel would be maintained, with its promise of equality. What do you think of this system? Is it workable?
- ❖ Can you think of a parallel idea that would achieve equality in a non-agrarian (not agriculturally based) society, similar to the one in which you live?

תהא מושתתה על יסודות החירות, הצדק והשלום לאור חזונו של נביאי ישראל;
it will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel;

ירמיה, ל"ד; ח'- י"ז

(ח) הדבר אשר היה אל ירמיהו מאת ה' אחרי כרת המלך צדקיהו ברית את כל העם אשר בירושלם לקרא להם דרור: (ט) לשלח איש את עבדו ואיש את שפחתו העברי והעבריה הפשיים לבלתי עבד במ ביהודי אחיהו איש: (י) וישמעו כל השרים וכל העם אשר באו בברית לשלח איש את עבדו ואיש את שפחתו הפשיים לבלתי עבד במ עוד וישמעו וישלחו: (יא) וישובו אחרי כן וישבו את העבדים ואת השפחות אשר שלחו הפשיים וכבשום לעבדים ולשפחות: (יב) ויהי דבר ה' אל ירמיהו מאת ה' לאמר: (יג) כה אמר ה' אלהי ישראל אנכי כרתי ברית את אבותיכם ביום הוצאי אותם מארץ מצרים מבית עבדים לאמר: (יד) מקץ שבע שנים תשלחו איש את אחיו העברי אשר ימכר לך ועבדך שש שנים ושלחתו הפשי מעמד ולא שמעו אבותיכם אלי ולא הטו את אזנם: (טו) ותשבּו אתם היום ותעשו את הנשר בעיני לקרא דרור איש לרעהו ותכרתו ברית לפני בבית אשר נקרא שמי עליו: (טז) ותשבּו ותחללו את שמי ותשבּו איש את עבדו ואיש את שפחתו אשר שלחתם הפשיים לנפשם ותכבשו אתם להיות לכם לעבדים ולשפחות: (יז) לכן כה אמר ה' אתם לא שמעתם אלי לקרא דרור איש לאחיו ואיש לרעהו הנני קרא לכם דרור נאם ה' אל החרב אל הדבר ואל הרעב ונתתי אתכם לזעוה לכל ממלכות הארץ:

- ❖ What does the text in Jeremiah add to the previous text from the Book of Leviticus?
Does the description of what happened in Jeremiah change your mind (or strengthen your original opinion) about whether the returning of land and freeing of slaves is realistic?
- ❖ What is a parallel situation to that of Jeremiah today?
- ❖ How does this Hebrew usage of the word freedom (dror – דרור) translated here as “liberty”) differ from the meanings you encountered in prior pages?



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13

3a. “It will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel”:
The Meaning and Limits of Freedom: Free-for-All? (1)

“An Experimental Contest”

Nathan Alterman, *Ha-Tor Ha-Shvi'i*

Four famous liberties
Met in the autumn breeze
And decided to organize a race, just for fun
With a crown of flowers for the one who won.

So along the starting line all four stood:
Freedom from fear,
Freedom from want,
Freedom of religion,
And freedom of speech.
And the public and its leaders stood around.

But before they had a chance to begun to run
A strange being, limping and cumbersome
arrived on the scene
A fifth competitor, unmentioned and uninvited,
Tottering on one leg
To join the neat row of four liberties.
Laughing slyly and pointing, he said:
I shall also join your running race.

The liberties raised their fine voices
And asked with scorn and compassion: who
is this unfortunate?
What freedom are you?
Squinting and stuttering the unfortunate
replied:
I am the freedom of distortion!

Laughter erupted all around
Like a waterfall:
How will such a creature compete with his
lithe opponents?!
He will stumble and fall, he will make a
mockery of himself!
He is a weakling, a midget, a nothing!

Now, though, the race begins and the
laughter dies down
Slowly the crowd turns to stone
Eyes wide open, tongues silent
The limping distortion
Has come in first place!
Another contest is held, and another one still
Again the distortion passes
All competitors!
And as they pass the finish line behind him
They barely recognize themselves!

תחרות לנסיון / נתן אלטרמן מתוך : הטור השביעי א'

ארבע חריזות נודעות לתהילה
החליטו בנשב רוח - סתו קלילה,
לערך תחרות בריצה, לשם שחוק,
ואשר תנצח - זר ויתן לה כחק.

אז נצבו בשורה ארבעתן, לאמר:
החפש מפחד,
החפש ממחסור,
וחפש הדת,
וחפש הדבור,
וסביבן - הקהל וראשי הצבור.

אך בטרם התחילו
ארח לרוץ,
נתגלה יצור פלא, צולע וגוף,
איזה חפש מוזר, חמישי במספר,
שאפלו ברמז עליו לא דובר,
ויגש, מדדה על רגלו החרגת,
אל ארבע חריזות ערוכות לתפארת,
ויצחק ערמומי ויד בקריצה:
אתחרה גם אני עמכן בריצה.

אז נשאו חריזות את קולן כמו נבל
ותשאלנה בבוז ורחמים: מי הנפל?
איזה חפש אתה?
ובמצמוץ ולפלפוף
סח הנפל: אני הוא חופש הסלוף!

צחוק נתך מסביב
כמפל המים:
הלזה יתחרה עם קלות הרגלים?
הוא יכרע! הוא יפול! הוא יהיה לקלס!
הוא חגר! הוא גמד! הוא משול כחרס!

אבל הס... התחרות מתחילה! הצחוק תם...
אט לאט מתאבן הקהל הנדהם -
רחבו העיניים! אלמה כל לשון!
הסלוף הפסח
מגיע ראשון!

ובמרכז הזירה התיצב הסלוף
ויקרא: לי הכתר! אני האלוף!

הסלוף זה טיבו! הוא מצניע פנים.
הוא מתחיל בריצה
למרחקים קטנים!
הוא מתחיל בתחרות-נסיון, קו לקו,
אבל בה מאמן הוא כח רגליו...
ולכן, אם ירשה העולם לו לרוץ
הוא יכול, החגר הלזה והגוף,
לעבר כל תקוות לאומים, כל הלום,
ולהגיע ראשון
אל מטרת השלום!

הנותנים לו לגשת לשדה התחרות
מנחילים למפרע תבוסה לחרות!

Fear then seizes the four freedoms
And only their chattering teeth can be heard.
And of course, chattering feverishly,
Freedom from fear shook in terror!

And distortion stood in the center of the ring,
Calling out: I have the crown! I am the champion!

This is the nature of distortion. He keeps his
appearance modest.
He begins by running short sprints.
He runs a short race by way of an experiment
But trains himself as he does so.
And if the world lets him,
He will run against all the hopes and dreams of the
nation,
And first of all he will reach the goals of peace!
**Those who permit distortion to enter the race
Bring upon liberty immediate disgrace!**

- ❖ Which of Natan Alterman's freedoms is most precious to you: freedom from fear, freedom from want, freedom of religion or freedom of speech? Is there another freedom that is more important to you than these ones? If so, what is it?
- ❖ What fears prevent us from protecting our freedoms or another's freedoms?



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13

3a. “It will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel”:
The Meaning and Limits of Freedom: Free-for-All? (1)

Slaves

Words and music: Berry Sakharof

By the banks of the River Aspirin
We sat in our usual seats
Not hearing, not seeing
As if we were air.
The movie will finish soon
Coming next: reality
The picture is blurred
And the sound unclear.

Because we are all slaves
Even though we're so hip and cool
Opening our mouth wide
And waiting for the next treat.
We're all hooked on someone
Who tells us to feel something now
Opening our mouth wide
And waiting for the next course.

The shop windows here are appealing
Everything's for sale
We also hang there
With exchange slips.
So what are we going to do with this
anger?
What's going to become of this jealousy?
Everyone wants to be free
But free from what, for God's sake – free
from what?

Picture Midrash

Can you see a connection between this cartoon and Berry Sakharof's song?

תהא מושתתה על יסודות
החירות, הצדק והשלום לאור
חזונם של נביאי ישראל;
it will be based on
freedom, justice and
peace as envisaged by
the prophets of Israel;

עבדים

מילים ולחן: ברי סחרוף

על נהר אספירין ישבנו
במקומות המוכרים,
לא שומעים לא רואים
כאילו אנחנו אוויר.
עוד מעט ייגמר הסרט
בקרב המציאות,
התמונה מטושטשת
והצליל לא ברור.

כי כולנו עבדים אפילו
שיש לנו כזה כאילו
פותחים פה גדול
ומחכים לעונג הבא.
כולנו מכורים של מישהו,
שמבקש עכשיו תרגישו,
פותחים פה גדול
ומחכים למנה הבאה.

חלונות ראוה יפים פה,
זה הכל למכירה,
גם אנחנו תלויים
עם פתקי החלפה.
אז מה נעשה עם הכעס הזה
מה יהיה עם הקנאה?
כולם רוצים להיות חופשיים
אבל ממה אלוהים ממה...





Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13

**3b. “It will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel”:
The Meaning and Limits of Freedom: Free-for-All? (2)**

Declaration of the Rights of Man and the Citizen, French National Assembly (27 August 1789)

Article 4

Liberty consists in the freedom to do everything which injures no one else; hence the exercise of the natural rights of each man has no limits except those which assure to the other members of the society the enjoyment of the same rights. These limits can only be determined by law.

Article 5

Law can only prohibit such actions as are hurtful to society. Nothing may be prevented which is not forbidden by law, and no one may be forced to do anything not provided for by law.

...תהא מושתתה על יסודות החירות...

it will be based on **freedom**...

Martin Buber, Summer 1934

Liberty is not something that you can maintain as you wish or in an arbitrary manner; its essential significance and purpose is the realization of destiny. Only he who is responsible for history is free with regard to history (Buber continues with comments about the destiny of the Jewish people).

The Jewish people was reticent to accept its destiny, and as a result was subjected to exile and subjugation. Yet it was promised that it would return once cleansed of its iniquities. It would return not merely to its Land, and not merely to its independence and mastery, but to the true liberty it held and lost: the liberty to embark on the realization of its destiny.

Martin Buber, “Liberty and Destiny,” *Record and Destiny A*, Jerusalem 5744, p. 216.

- ❖ What are the limits of freedom according to Rousseau, the French National Assembly and Martin Buber? How do they differ?
- ❖ When can we (and indeed must we) restrict the freedom of an individual or a nation?
- ❖ Martin Buber talks about the destiny of the Jewish People. Do you agree that the Jewish People has a destiny? What difference does having a destiny make in the limits of freedom?
- ❖ What challenges are faced by free humans and by societies that have gained their freedom and independence?
- ❖ Are Jews freer in the Land of Israel or in the United States?
- ❖ **Picture Midrash** The picture on the right is titled Absence of Freedom. What in this picture makes you feel absence of freedom? Where in your life do you find absence of freedom?

**Jean Jacques Rousseau (1712-1778),
The Social Contract and the Discourses, Translated by G.D.H. Cole,
Everyman’s Library, Alfred A. Knopf
NY/Toronto 1931**

Man is born free; and everywhere he is in chains... To renounce liberty is to renounce being a man, to surrender the rights of humanity and even its duties. For him who renounces everything no indemnity is possible. Such a renunciation is incompatible with man’s nature; to remove all liberty from his will is to remove all morality from his acts... What man loses by the social contract is his natural liberty and an unlimited right to everything he tries to get and succeeds in getting; what he gains is civil liberty and the proprietorship of all he possesses... moral liberty, which alone makes him truly master of himself; for the mere impulse of appetite is slavery, while obedience to a law which we prescribe to ourselves is liberty.



By R. Gopakumar [1] (Own work) [CC-BY-SA-3.0 (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0>) or GFDL (<http://www.gnu.org/copyleft/fdl.html>)], via Wikimedia Commons



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13
4. Freedom of Thought, Expression and Protest:
By What Means? – The Duty and Limits of Protest

Genesis 18:16-33

16 And the men rose up from there, and looked out toward Sodom; and Abraham went with them to bring them on the way. 17 And the LORD said: “Shall I hide from Abraham that which I am doing; 18 seeing that Abraham shall surely become a great and mighty nation, and all the nations of the earth shall be blessed in him? 19 For I have known him, to the end that he may command his children and his household after him, that they may keep the way of the LORD, to do righteousness and justice; to the end that the LORD may bring upon Abraham that which He has spoken of him.” 20 And the LORD said: “Verily, the cry of Sodom and Gomorrah is great, and, verily, their sin is exceeding grievous. 21 I will go down now, and see whether they have done altogether according to the cry of it, which is come unto Me; and if not, I will know.” 22 And the men turned from there, and went toward Sodom; but Abraham stood yet before the LORD. 23 And Abraham drew near, and said: “Will You indeed sweep away the righteous with the wicked? 24 Peradventure there are fifty righteous within the city; will You indeed sweep away and not forgive the place for the fifty righteous that are therein? 25 That be far from You to do after this manner, to slay the righteous with the wicked, that so the righteous should be as the wicked; that be far from You; shall not the Judge of all the earth do justly?” 26 And the LORD said: “If I find in Sodom fifty righteous within the city, then I will forgive all the place for their sake.” 27 And Abraham answered and said: “Behold now, I have taken upon me to speak unto the LORD, who am I but dust and ashes. 28 Peradventure there shall lack five of the fifty righteous; will You destroy all the city for lack of five?” And He said: “I will not destroy it, if I find there forty and five.” 29 And he spoke unto Him yet again, and said: “Peradventure there shall be forty found there.” And He said: “I will not do it for the forty’s sake.” 30 And he said: “Oh, let not the LORD be angry, and I will speak. Peradventure there shall thirty be found there.” And He said: “I will not do it, if I find thirty there.” 31 And he said: “Behold now, I have taken upon me to speak unto the LORD. Peradventure there shall be twenty found there.” And He said: “I will not destroy it for the twenty’s sake.” 32 And he said: “Oh, let not the LORD be angry, and I will speak yet but this once. Peradventure ten shall be found there.” And He said: “I will not destroy it for the ten’s sake.” 33 And the LORD went His way, as soon as He had left off speaking to Abraham; and Abraham returned unto his place.

בראשית, י"ח; ט"ז- ל"ג
 (טז) וַיִּקְמוּ מִשָּׁם הָאֲנָשִׁים וַיִּשְׁקְפוּ עַל פְּנֵי סְדֹם וְאֵבְרָהָם
 הֹלֵךְ עִמָּם לְשַׁלְחָם :
 (יז) וְה' אָמַר הַמִּכְסָּה אֲנִי מֵאֲבְרָהָם אֲשֶׁר אֲנִי עֹשֶׂה :
 (יח) וְאֵבְרָהָם הָיוּ יְהִיָּה לְגוֹי גָדוֹל וְעֵצוֹם וְנִבְרָכוּ בּוֹ כָּל
 גּוֹיֵי הָאָרֶץ :
 (יט) כִּי יִדְעִיתִי לְמַעַן אֲשֶׁר יִצְוָה אֶת בְּנָיו וְאֵת בֵּיתוֹ
 אַחֲרָיו וְשָׁמְרוּ דְרָגְךָ ה' לַעֲשׂוֹת צְדָקָה וּמִשְׁפָּט לְמַעַן הִבִּיא
 ה' עַל אֲבְרָהָם אֵת אֲשֶׁר דִּבַּר עִלְיוֹ :
 (כ) וַיֹּאמֶר ה' זַעֲקֵת סְדֹם וְעַמָּהָ כִּי רָבָה וְחַטָּאתָם כִּי
 כְּבֹדָה מְאֹד :
 (כא) אֲרֻדָּה נָא וְאֶרְאֶה הַכְּצַעֲקָתָהּ הַבָּאָה אֵלַי עֲשׂוּ כָּל־
 וְאִם לֹא אֲדַעָה :
 (כב) וַיִּפְנוּ מִשָּׁם הָאֲנָשִׁים וַיֵּלְכוּ סְדֹמָה וְאֵבְרָהָם עֹדְנֵי
 עֹמֵד לִפְנֵי ה' :
 (כג) וַיִּגַּשׁ אֲבְרָהָם וַיֹּאמֶר הָאֵף תִּסְפָּה צְדִיק עִם רָשָׁע :
 (כד) אוֹלַי יֵשׁ חַמְשִׁים צְדִיקִים בְּתוֹךְ הָעִיר הָאֵף תִּסְפָּה
 וְלֹא תִשָּׂא לְמִקְוִים לְמַעַן חַמְשִׁים הַצְדִיקִים אֲשֶׁר בְּקִרְבָּה :
 (כה) חֲלֵלָה לְךָ מַעֲשֵׂת כְּדָבָר הַזֶּה לְהַמִּית צְדִיק עִם רָשָׁע
 וְהִיָּה כְּצְדִיק כְּרָשָׁע חֲלֵלָה לְךָ הַשִּׁפְט כָּל הָאָרֶץ לֹא יַעֲשֶׂה
 מִשְׁפָּט :
 (כו) וַיֹּאמֶר ה' אִם אֲמַצָּא בְּסֹדֶם חַמְשִׁים צְדִיקִים בְּתוֹךְ
 הָעִיר וְנִשְׂאָתִי לְכָל הַמָּקוֹם בְּעִבּוֹרָם :
 (כז) וַיַּעַן אֲבְרָהָם וַיֹּאמֶר הִנֵּה נָא הוֹאֲלֵתִי לְדַבֵּר אֶל אֲדֹנָי
 וְאֲנֹכִי עֹפֵר וְאֹפֵר :
 (כח) אוֹלַי יִחְסְרוּן חַמְשִׁים הַצְדִיקִים הַחַמְשָׁה הַתְּשֻׁחִית
 בַּחֲמָשָׁה אֵת כָּל הָעִיר וַיֹּאמֶר לֹא אֲשַׁחִית אִם אֲמַצָּא שָׁם
 אַרְבָּעִים וְחַמְשָׁה :
 (כט) וַיִּסָּף עוֹד לְדַבֵּר אֵלָיו וַיֹּאמֶר אוֹלַי יִמָּצְאוּ שָׁם
 אַרְבָּעִים וַיֹּאמֶר לֹא אַעֲשֶׂה בְּעִבּוֹר הָאֲרָבָעִים :
 (ל) וַיֹּאמֶר אֵל נָא יִחַר לֵאדֹנָי וְאֲדַבְּרָה אוֹלַי יִמָּצְאוּ שָׁם
 שְׁלֹשִׁים וַיֹּאמֶר לֹא אַעֲשֶׂה אִם אֲמַצָּא שָׁם שְׁלֹשִׁים :
 (לא) וַיֹּאמֶר הִנֵּה נָא הוֹאֲלֵתִי לְדַבֵּר אֶל אֲדֹנָי אוֹלַי
 יִמָּצְאוּ שָׁם עֶשְׂרִים וַיֹּאמֶר לֹא אֲשַׁחִית בְּעִבּוֹר הָעֶשְׂרִים :
 (לב) וַיֹּאמֶר אֵל נָא יִחַר לֵאדֹנָי וְאֲדַבְּרָה אִךְ הַפַּעַם אוֹלַי
 יִמָּצְאוּ שָׁם עֶשְׂרֵה וַיֹּאמֶר לֹא אֲשַׁחִית בְּעִבּוֹר הָעֶשְׂרֵה :
 (לג) וַיֵּלֶךְ ה' כְּאֲשֶׁר כָּלָה לְדַבֵּר אֶל אֲבְרָהָם וְאֵבְרָהָם שָׁב
 לְמִקְמוֹ :

תהא מושתתה על יסודות החירות, הצדק והשלום לאור חזונו של נביאי ישראל;
 it will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel:

- ❖ Why does God need “to go down” in order to know what is happening in Sodom?
- ❖ Do you think that Abraham was being particularly courageous in confronting God?
- ❖ What strategy did Abraham employ in protesting to God?
- ❖ Why do you think Abraham stopped at ten righteous persons? Are there confrontations for which it makes sense to limit the extent of protest? Give some examples and discuss why.
- ❖ Why is Abraham’s confrontation at Sodom such a prominent story in the Torah?



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13

**4. Freedom of Thought, Expression and Protest:
By What Means? – The Duty and Limits of Protest**

2 Samuel 12: 1-25

1 And the LORD sent Nathan unto David. And he came unto him, and said unto him: ‘There were two men in one city: the one rich, and the other poor. **2** The rich man had exceeding many flocks and herds; **3** but the poor man had nothing save one little ewe lamb, which he had bought and reared; and it grew up together with him, and with his children; it did eat of his own morsel, and drank of his own cup, and lay in his bosom, and was unto him as a daughter. **4** And there came a traveler unto the rich man, and he spared to take of his own flock and of his own herd, to dress for the wayfaring man that was come unto him, but took the poor man’s lamb, and dressed it for the man that was come to him.’ **5** And David’s anger was greatly kindled against the man; and he said to Nathan: ‘As the LORD lives, the man that hath done this deserves to die; **6** and he shall restore the lamb fourfold, because he did this thing, and because he had no pity.’ **7** And Nathan said to David: ‘You are the man. Thus says the LORD, the God of Israel: I anointed you king over Israel, and I delivered you out of the hand of Saul; **8** and I gave you your master’s house, and your master’s wives into your bosom, and gave you the house of Israel and of Judah; and if that were too little, then would I add unto you so much more. **9** Wherefore hast you despised the word of the LORD, to do that which is evil in My sight? Uriah the Hittite you hast smitten with the sword, and his wife you have taken to be your wife, and him you have slain with the sword of the children of Ammon. **10** Now therefore, the sword shall never depart from your house; because you have despised Me, and have taken the wife of Uriah the Hittite to be your wife. **11** Thus says the LORD: Behold, I will raise up evil against you out of your own house, and I will take your wives before your eyes, and give them unto your neighbor, and he shall lie with your wives in the sight of this sun. **12** For you did it secretly; but I will do this thing before all Israel, and before the sun.’ **13** And David said unto Nathan: ‘I have sinned against the LORD.’ And

Nathan said unto David: ‘The LORD also has put away your sin; you shall not die. **14** Howbeit, because by this deed you have greatly blasphemed the enemies of the LORD, the child also that is born unto you shall surely die.’ **15** And Nathan departed unto his house. And the LORD struck the child that Uriah’s wife bore unto David, and it was very sick. **16** David therefore besought God for the child; and David fasted, and as often as he went in, he lay all night upon the earth. **17** And the elders of his house arose, and stood beside him, to raise him up from the earth; but he would not, neither did he eat bread with them. **18** And it came to pass on the seventh day, that the child died. And the servants of David feared to tell him that the child was dead; for they said: ‘Behold, while the child was yet alive, we spoke unto him, and he hearkened not unto our voice; how then shall we tell him that the child is dead, so that he do himself some harm?’ **19** But when David saw that his servants whispered together, David

תהא מושתתה על יסודות החירות, הצדק והשלום לאור חזונו של נביאי ישראל;
it will be based on **freedom**, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel;

perceived that the child was dead; and David said unto his servants: ‘Is the child dead?’ And they said: ‘He is dead.’ **20** Then David arose from the earth, and washed, and anointed himself, and changed his apparel; and he came into the house of the LORD, and worshipped; then he

came to his own house; and when he required, they set bread before him, and he did eat. **21** Then said his servants unto him: ‘What thing is this that you hast done? you didst fast and weep for the child, while it was alive; but when the child was dead, you did rise and eat bread.’ **22** And he said: ‘While the child was yet alive, I fasted and wept; for I said: Who knows whether the LORD will not be gracious to me, that the child may live? **23** But now he is dead, wherefore should I fast? can I bring him back again? I shall go to him, but he will not return to me.’ **24** And David comforted Bath-sheba his wife, and went in unto her, and lay with her; and she bore a son, and called his name Solomon. And the LORD loved him; **25** and He sent by the hand of Nathan the prophet, and he called his name Jedidiah, for the LORD’s sake.



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13

4. Freedom of Thought, Expression and Protest:
By What Means? – The Duty and Limits of Protest

שמואל ב', י"ב; א'-כ"ה

(א) וישלח ה' את נתן אל דוד ויבא אליו ויאמר לו שני אנשים היו בעיר אחת אחד עשיר ואחד ראש: (ב) לעשיר היתה צאן וביקר הרבה מאד: (ג) ולרש אין כל כי אם כבשה אחת קטנה אשר קנה ויחיה ותגדל עמו ועם בניו יחדו מפתו תאכל ומכסו תשתה ובחיקו תשקב ותהי לו כבת: (ד) ויבא הלך לאיש העשיר ויחמל לקחת מצאנו ומבקר לעשות לארם הבא לו ויטח את כבשת האיש הראש ויעשה לאיש הבא אליו: (ה) ויחר אף דוד באיש מאד ויאמר אל נתן חי ה' כי בן מנת האיש העשה זאת: (ו) ואת הכבשה ישלם ארבעתים עקב אשר עשה את הדבר הזה ועל אשר לא חמל: (ז) ויאמר נתן אל דוד אתה האיש כה אמר ה' אלהי ישראל אנכי משחתיך למלך על ישראל ואנכי הצלתיך מיד שאול: (ח) ואתנה לך את בית אדניך ואת נשי אדניך בחיקך ואתנה לך את בית ישראל ויהודה ואם מעט ואספה לך כהנה וכהנה: (ט) מדוע בזית את דבר ה' לעשות הרע בעיני את אוריה החתי הכית בחרב ואת אשתו לקחת לך לאשה ואתו הרגת בחרב בני עמון: (י) ועתה לא תסור חרב מביתך עד עולם עקב כי בזתני ותקח את אשת אוריה החתי להיות לך לאשה: (יא) כה אמר ה' הנני מקים עליך רעה מביתך ולקחתי את נשיך לעיניך ונתתי לרעיך ושקב עם נשיך לעיני השמש הזאת: (יב) כי אתה עשית בסתר ואני אעשה את הדבר הזה נגד כל ישראל ונגד השמש: (יג) ויאמר דוד אל נתן חטאתי לה' ויאמר נתן אל דוד גם ה' העביר חטאתך לא תמות: (יד) אפס כי נאץ נאצת את איבי ה' בדבר הזה גם הבן הילוד לך מות ימות: (טו) וילך נתן אל ביתו ויגף ה' את הילד אשר ילדה אשת אוריה לדוד ויאנש: (טז) ויבקש דוד את האלהים בעד הנער ויצם דוד צום ובא ולו ושקב ארצה: (יז) ויקמו זקני ביתו עליו להקימו מן הארץ ולא אבה ולא ברא אתם לחם: (יח) ויהי ביום השביעי ויקמת הילד ויראו עבדי דוד להגיד לו כי מת הילד כי אמרו הנה בהיות הילד חי דברנו אליו ולא שמע בקולנו ואידך נאמר אליו מת הילד ועשה רעה: (יט) וירא דוד כי עבדיו מתלחשים ויבן דוד כי מת הילד ויאמר דוד אל עבדיו המת הילד ויאמרו מת: (כ) ויקם דוד מהארץ וירחץ ויטף ויחלף שמלתיו ויבא בית ה' וישתחו ויבא אל ביתו וישאל וישימו לו לחם ויאכל: (כא) ויאמרו עבדיו אליו מה הדבר הזה אשר עשית בעבור הילד חי צמת ותבדך וכאשר מת הילד קמת ותאכל לחם: (כב) ויאמר בעוד הילד חי צמתי ואבקה כי אמרתי מי יודע וחנני ה' וחי הילד: (כג) ועתה מת למה זה אני צם האוכל להשיבו עוד אני הלך אליו והוא לא ישוב אלי: (כד) וינחם דוד את בת שבע אשתו ויבא אליה וישקב עמה ותלד בן ותקרא את שמו שלמה וה' אהבו: (כה) וישלח ביד נתן הנביא ויקרא את שמו וידקה בעבור ה':

- ❖ Why do you think the Prophet Nathan began his confrontation of King David with a parable?
- ❖ Have you ever confronted an authority figure about an injustice that you perceived? What did you say and do?
- ❖ King David fasted in an attempt to avert the decree of death to his child. Fasting is sometimes used in protest. Do you think it can be an effective tool? If so, for what aims?

תהא מושתתה על
 יסודות החירות, הצדק
 והשלום לאור חזונם של
 נביאי ישראל;
 it will be based on
 freedom, justice and
 peace as envisaged
 by the prophets of
 Israel;



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13
4. Freedom of Thought, Expression and Protest:
By What Means? – The Duty and Limits of Protest

Mishna Rosh Hashanah 2:8-9

R. Gamliel used to have a diagram of the phases of the moon on a tablet [hung] on the wall of his upper chamber, which he used to show to the common folk and ask: Did [the moon] look like this or like that? On one occasion two witnesses came and said: We saw it in the morning in the east and in the evening in the west. R. Yohanan b. Nuri then said they were false witnesses. When they came to Yavne, however, R. Gamliel accepted [their testimony]. On another occasion two witnesses came and said: We saw it at its proper time, but on the night we should have seen the new moon it was not seen, and R. Gamliel [had already] accepted their evidence. R. Dosa b. Harkinas said they were false witnesses. How could one testify that a woman has given birth when on the next day we see her belly still swollen? R. Yehoshua said to him: I see [the force of] your argument. R. Gamliel then sent for him saying: I request that you appear before me with your staff and your money on the day which, according to your calculations, should be Yom Kippur. R. Akiva went [to R. Yehoshua] and found him in great distress. He said to him: I can bring proof [from the Torah] that whatever R. Gamliel has done is valid, because it says: *These are the appointed seasons of God, holy occasions, which you shall proclaim at their proper times.* (Leviticus 23:4) [This means that] whether they are proclaimed at their proper time or not at their proper time, I have no appointed seasons other than these. [R. Yehoshua] then went to R. Dosa b. Harkinas, who said to him: If we question [the decisions of] the beit din of R. Gamliel, we must question the decisions of every beit din which has existed since the days of Moses up until the present time. As it says: *Moses and Aaron, Nadav and Avihu and seventy of the elders of Israel then went up.* (Exodus 24:9) Why were the names of the elders not mentioned? To teach that every group of three which has acted as a beit din over Israel is as the beit din of Moses himself. [R. Yehoshua] then took his staff and his money and went to Yavne to R. Gamliel on the day he had calculated to be Yom Kippur. R. Gamliel rose and kissed him on his head and said to him: Come in peace, my teacher and my disciple – my teacher in wisdom and my disciple because you have accepted my decision.

Babylonian Talmud, Tractate Shabbat 54b-55a

Rab and R. Hanina, R. Johanan and R. Habiba taught [the following]... Whoever can forbid his household [to commit a sin] but does not, is seized for [the sins of] his household; [if he can forbid] his fellow citizens, he is seized for [the sins of] his fellow citizens; if the whole world, he is seized for [the sins of] the whole world. R. Papa observed, And the members of the Resh Galutha's [household] are seized for the whole world. Even as R. Hanina said, Why is it written (Isaiah 3:14), "The Lord will enter into judgment with the elders of his people, and the princes thereof", if the princes sinned, how did the elders sin? But say, [He will bring punishment] upon the elders because they do not forbid the princes.

- ❖ Why was Rabban Gamliel determined not to change his ruling setting the new month?
- ❖ Why do you think that Rabban Gamliel decided to make an example of R. Yehoshua? Was his motivation legitimate?
- ❖ Why did Rabbi Yehoshua back down in the end and submit to Rabban Gamliel's authority?
- ❖ Have you ever been in a situation similar to that faced by Rabbi Yehoshua? What did you do?



תהא מושתתה על יסודות החירות,
הצדק והשלום לאור חזונו של
נביאי ישראל;
it will be based on **freedom**,
justice and peace as envisaged
by the prophets of Israel;

- ❖ Have you ever been in a situation where you should have protested but did not? When?
- ❖ Can you give examples of when leaders of local institutions failed to lead a protest that it was their responsibility to lead?



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13:

2. “It will be based on freedom...”: Freedom from Without and Within

Section of Declaration of Independence: “The State of Israel... will be based on freedom”	Topic: The meaning of freedom	Texts in focus: Varied selection of classical Jewish and legal sources, poetry and prose	Lesson length: 60-90 minutes (see options)
--	--------------------------------------	---	---

Overview This lesson takes a step back from the political reality of the State of Israel to explore different meanings of freedom and its synonyms. A variety of short texts from the Torah and prophets, to rabbinic, medieval and modern commentaries, legal covenants and poetry will give inspiration to an art project through which the students will give their own expression to the value of freedom. Choose from among four suggested learning formats, including a student-parent pre-Passover school event.

- Goals**
- To explore the different ways in which Jewish law and civil law protect the freedom of individuals through individual and state obligation.
 - To differentiate between “freedom from” and “freedom to.”
 - To understand the meanings of various Hebrew words for freedom (liberty).

Rationale Freedom is a complex ideal. This lesson explores meanings of freedom in Jewish and (a few) non-Jewish texts across the centuries, inviting discussion on the meaning of being a free person, on the difference between physical, spiritual and ideological enslavement and on the implications of freedom and independence. The texts included are divided into three groups according to the Hebrew word for freedom used: *herut* (חרות), *hofesh* (חופש) and *dror* (דרור). *Herut* and *hofesh* are usually translated as “freedom” while *dror* is usually translated as “liberty.” In English the two words are used synonymously, although liberty is often used in conjunction with the granting and enjoyment of various social, political or economic rights and privileges and that is the case in the Hebrew as well (see below).

The first set of texts, using the Hebrew word “*herut*,” begins with a short selection from Exodus in which we see that *herut* meaning “freedom” is spelled the same as the word “graven” used to describe the writing on the tablets of the 10 commandments. Here, the students can explore the traditional Jewish concept that true freedom comes through being a servant of the Divine and being obligated to the commandments. The idea is elaborated on explicitly in the next text from Mishna Avot, which links freedom to the study of Torah. The third text, from the Passover Haggadah, assumes that we are still slaves, notwithstanding our liberation from Egypt, provoking a discussion of why that is (might be) so. The next two texts, from HaRav Kook and Amos Oz, speak to the issue that freedom is a matter of will. A free person can be enslaved and a slave feel free; a blind person can feel that he or she sees and a seeing person can feel blind. The final text is a list of dictionary definitions for *herut*.

The second set of texts uses the Hebrew word *hofesh*. The selection from Exodus states the obligation to release a Hebrew slave in the seventh year of service. This obligation is unconditional and raises the question of the natural right of humans to freedom. The selection from Toni Morrison is a commentary on this obligation; the essence of being free is to work for the freedom of others. The Yehuda Halevy text, similar to some of the texts in the first group, brings the meaning of freedom back to being a servant of the Divine and enables exploration of



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13:

2. “It will be based on freedom...”: Freedom from Without and Within

this idea here as well.

The third set of texts uses the word *dror*, which is often translated as liberty. It is perhaps the most technically difficult, dealing with the obligation in the year of the *yovel* (jubilee) to return every person to his original possession of land, even in the cases of land forfeit in order to pay debts. (Note that there is also the obligation in the *shemita* (sabbatical) year to let the land lie fallow (Leviticus 25) and to remit debts (Deuteronomy 15)). The rabbis were aware that the ideal of maintaining equality of land ownership might actually prevent individuals from purchasing land from those who needed to sell in order to avoid sinking into poverty, and they constructed a series of laws to prevent this possibility. Similar laws were designed to prevent the refraining from making loans close to the sabbatical year for fear they would never be repaid. Shortly before the year 0 CE, using a legal device called a *prosbul*, Hillel essentially abrogated these laws by enabling the recovery of debts after the sabbatical year. Today, most see these laws as an ideal that can never work. The students are asked whether they agree with this ideal and whether they have ideas to reach a similar goal that could be implemented in non-agrarian societies. For more information, see “Sabbatical Year and Jubilee,” *The Torah: A Modern Commentary*, edited by W. Gunther Plaut, pp. 940-5, the commentary to Leviticus 25:1-23 in *Etz Hayim: Torah and Commentary*, beginning at p. 738 and “Prosbul,” *JewishEncyclopedia.com*, <http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/12390-prosbul#anchor1>.

In the activity section, a number of options are suggested for the text study. After studying the texts, the students will have an opportunity to give expression to their own understanding of freedom by using the technique of rip-art to create midrash on one of the texts studied. Texts and dilemmas involving limiting freedoms are explored in subsequent lessons in this chapter.

Materials/Preparation

Texts:

Herut (חרות)

- Exodus 32:15-16
- Mishna Avot 6:2
- Passover Haggadah – *ha lachma anya*
- HaRav Kook, Olat Re’iah (commentary on the prayer book) – Liberty (Herut)
- Amos Oz, from “Actions and Books” (1966), *In the Bright Blue Light*, Tel Aviv 1979, p. 13
- Dictionary Definitions- Liberty (Herut): Ben Yehuda Dictionary, Even Shoshan Dictionary, Rav Milim Dictionary.

Hofesh (חופש)

- Exodus 21:2
- Yehudah Halevy- Servants of Time
- The Universal Declaration of Human Rights, December 10, 1948
- Shiri Lev-Ari- “Memory Instead of Revenge,” interview with Tony Morrison, *Ha’aretz*, 11 April 2004



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13:

2. “It will be based on freedom...”: Freedom from Without and Within

Dror (דרור)

- Leviticus 25:10
- Jeremiah 34:8-17

Rip-art Midrash Activity: A3 (11” x 16.5”) white paper, one per hevruta pair; glue sticks or glue for each hevruta pair; plenty of sheets of colored paper in a variety of colors.

Activity

Text Study:

Option 1: Assign each set of texts to a different third of the class and have the students study in hevruta groups (groups of 2) using the suggested study questions. This way, each hevruta will have fewer texts so that they can study them in depth. Note that Set 3 is the most complicated and that Set 2 has the fewest texts – enabling the assigning of texts in accordance with the skill level of each group. For the rip-art midrash (see below), the students will use a text or texts from among those they studied. The students will learn about the texts of the other groups from the presentation of the artwork to the class.

Option 2: Each hevruta group studies all of the texts, progressing from one set to the next. This option is ideal for very strong academic learner classes. It requires at least 2 full class sessions with the rip-art midrash coming at the end of the text study (most likely the beginning of the second class session).

Option 3: Freedom Day – study each set of texts in succeeding sessions over the course of a day designated by the school (or class level), doing the rip-art midrash at the final session of the day. The students can remain in the same groups for each set of texts or can be switched to offer a varied study experience. A concluding discussion based on the texts studied should be held at the end of each study session held. The sessions can be interspersed with other activities such as the showing of films on the topic of freedom, singing songs on the theme or bringing in a speaker from a local organization working on relevant issues. The topic of freedom makes this program ideal as a pre-Passover program and the day can conclude with a freedom Seder.

Option 4: Vehigad'ta L'bincha (And you shall tell your children) Parent-Student Night – On Passover, parents are obligated to tell their children the story of the Exodus from Egypt, emphasizing that they, too, were part of the miracle of liberation. This commandment has evolved in our time to the holding of study programs in the Jewish community preceding Passover. The school can host an evening program for parents and students, similar to the Freedom Day suggested in Option 3. Parents and their children should gather together according to homeroom or some other class division so that each room is not overcrowded. Given time limits, it is recommended that you choose only one set of texts (we recommend the first as it lends itself best to hevruta discussion). Parents and their children should study and do the rip-art midrash together and presentation of the artwork should be done in groups no larger than 20.

Time/Notes:

Option 1
40 minutes

Option 2
60-70 minutes

Option 3
Time each study session according to its amount of texts: 60 min for the 1st, 45 for the 2nd, 30-35 for the 3rd.

Option 4
45 minutes for text study in groups



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13:

2. “It will be based on freedom...”: Freedom from Without and Within

<p><u>Rip Art Midrash</u>: Have each hevruta pair (same pairs as for the text study) choose a text from those studied upon which to develop a midrash (commentary on the text) through the technique of “rip-art.” Using the large white paper as the canvas, the students are to create a representation of their midrash on the text using the colored paper. No scissors are allowed. They may only rip the paper into various shapes and glue them on the white sheet. This technique is a good equalizer for those who don’t draw; however, it is not limiting at all and the students’ creations will vary from realistic to abstract.</p> <p><u>Conclusion</u> Invite the hevruta groups to share their artwork, explaining their commentary to the chosen text.</p>	<p>Rip-Art 20-30 minutes Early finishers can help arrange all the projects as an art exhibition. 3 minutes per group</p>
<p>Follow-up/Extension Work</p>	



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13:

**3a. “It will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel”:
The Meaning and Limits of Freedom: Free-for-All? (1)**

Section of Declaration of Independence: “The State of Israel... will be based on freedom”	Topic: Limits of freedom on different levels	Texts in focus: Poetry and Song	Lesson length: 1.5 hours (2 class sessions)
<p>Overview Using role plays and text study this lesson explores the limits of freedom on different levels, and the conflicts that arise when freedoms are restricted in order to safeguard other values and liberties. It begins with concrete dilemmas in the students’ lives at home and school. It then moves to broader questions of what kinds of things limit our ability to be truly free and limit our willingness to fight for the freedom of others. The text study portion of this lesson uses Hebrew poetry. See Lesson (2) in this series if you want to use political and philosophical texts that emphasize society’s role in limiting freedoms and the idea of limiting freedom in Israeli society in order to achieve the nation’s destiny.</p>			
<p>Goals</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To develop awareness of things in our lives that enslave us and distort reality. • To develop an understanding of the complexities involved in restricting and protecting freedoms and the effects of making decisions that favor one freedom over another. 			
<p>Rationale Freedom is an obvious fundamental right, but it is difficult to protect and challenging to limit. It is often said that “one’s freedom ends where another’s begins” or “your freedom ends if in exercising it you will hurt another.” While freedom is understood as a fundamental right of human beings, it is nonetheless restricted by law in order to protect other fundamental rights. The first place where we usually experience restrictions on our freedom is at home, and later at school.</p> <p>This lesson is divided into two sessions: 1) role-play dilemmas and 2) a text study. In the first session, it is suggested that you focus on the more familiar arenas of home and school and ask the students to work through dilemmas such as “the right to a messy room” at home and “the freedom of personal expression through body piercings” and the “freedom of expression on one’s Facebook page” at school. Role playing the dilemmas requires the students to consider the values in conflict and decide when it is appropriate or even necessary to restrict personal freedoms.</p> <p>Between the first and second sessions, a follow-up activity is suggested that connects the dilemmas in Session 1 and Berry Sakharof’s song taught in Session 2 about being enslaved to our addictions. Challenge the students to stop using their cell phones until the next session and then open that session by exploring the impact this had on them.</p> <p>In the second session, the students are asked to study two poems. In his song “Slaves” Berry Sakharof maintains that our addictions blur reality while making us think that the clarity we experience is what is truly real. We are slaves to our addictions and to our desire for material goods. Here the students can discuss the variety of things to which they and others are addicted. It is clear from the song that the possibilities are not limited to drugs or alcohol – many things can be “mind altering.” In the second poem, “An Experimental Contest,” Natan Alterman makes rather harsh claims about human willingness to permit distortion and fear to limit their desire to protect essential freedoms. The students are invited to examine their own and society’s distortions and</p>			



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13:

**3a. “It will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel”:
The Meaning and Limits of Freedom: Free-for-All? (1)**

fears that limit protection of freedoms.

Materials/Preparation

Texts:

- Primary text from the Declaration of Independence: “It will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel.”
- Nathan Alterman, “An Experimental Contest”
- Berry Sakharof, “Slaves” www.youtube.com/watch?v=h9F6xByjiZ8 or easymusicdownload.com/Berry-Sakharof-Slaves_4604569.html

Computer and Screen – for playing Berry Sakharof song.

Dilemma Role Plays (see below)

Activity

Class Session One: Free-for-All: Dilemma Role Plays

We present below three different dilemmas relating to the limits of freedom at school and home. Use these scenarios or create your own. Divide the class into the number of small groups that will enable all the students to have an active role (6-7 students per group). More than one group can be given the same scenario. Have the students read, discuss and resolve their dilemma and plan how they will act it out for the rest of class. Have the groups with same dilemma role play in sequence for the class and discuss the issues raised after each set is presented.

Alternate Method #1: Use only one or two of the dilemmas so that you have at least two groups doing each of them. Have one group begin its role play and progress long enough to develop in a clear direction. Then allow students from the other group(s) that prepared the same dilemma to take the place of one character at a time to present new issues, ideas or ways of resolving the dilemma in the voice of that character. The student joining the role play should tap the shoulder of the student s/he wishes to replace and immediately enter character. The movement should be dynamic; another student can do the same after giving opportunity for the group to respond to the new voice that joined.

Alternate Method #2 – The Protest Tent: Choose only one of the dilemmas and hand out the same one to each group for small group discussion of the issues. *Eliminate the instruction to develop a role play of the dilemma.* At the end of the discussion period, set up a “Protest Tent.” In the tent are three chairs or stools, stable enough to stand on. The first chair is for those in favor of the student position, e.g. the right to come to school with face rings or the right of the student body president to publish discriminatory speech on his Facebook page. The second chair is for those opposed to the position and a third chair in the middle is for the

Time/Notes:

10-15 minutes preparation

7 minutes per group presentation and discussion

Adopt the Israeli Social Justice Protest rules of discourse (!): No-one interrupts the speaker. If you agree with the speaker, rather than repeat the point when it is your turn, raise your hands in



Chapter 3 / Paragraph 13:

**3a. “It will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel”:
The Meaning and Limits of Freedom: Free-for-All? (1)**

<p>undecided. A few students at a time line up behind each chair (the rest remain seated) and the first person “in favor” stands on the chair and speaks for up to two minutes. The right to speak then goes to a student opposed and then to a student who is undecided. Continue the rounds as time permits or until the students no longer have new points to make.</p> <p>Follow-up/Extension Work</p> <p>Challenge your students to refrain from using their cell phones until your next lesson with them when you plan to continue with the session below. This will work best if you have at least a few days if not a week! Ask them to log how they used their time differently, if at all, as a result of not being able to use their phones. When they return to class, discuss briefly how their lives changed, if at all, during this period: Did they have more quiet time with themselves? With family members or friends? Did they read more? Did they pay more attention to what they were doing (since they weren’t having a conversation while doing something else at the same time)? Were they more restricted as a result of not having their phones? Did they miss important information or get-togethers?</p> <p><u>Class Session Two: Text Study</u></p> <p>Begin with a discussion of the cell phone restriction experience if you implemented the exercise. Follow by playing Berry Sakharof’s song “Slaves” provided in the YouTube link above.</p> <p>Have the students study in hevruta the poems of Sakharof and Alterman with the study questions provided. As stated in the rationale above, the poems focus on the distortion of reality and other agents that limit our freedom.</p> <p><u>Conclusion</u> In the large group, choose from among the following questions for discussion:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Is there language in either Alterman’s or Sakharof’s poems that relates to or helps clarify what was happening to the characters in the dilemmas of our last class session? 2. What things in our lives cause distortion of reality (Alterman)? How does distortion take away our and others’ freedom? What is lost when such freedoms are limited? What are we addicted to that infringes on our freedom (Sakharof)? 3. Connecting to the dilemmas of the previous lesson: How are the limits of behavior different at home, school and in the larger society? Should they be different? Why / why not? 	<p>the air and shake them a bit. When lots of folks do that, you can see immediately the number in favor of that view. If you disagree, raise your hands and cross them in an “X” in front of your face. To interrupt, if you really have to, make a “cut” sign and the speaker can choose to yield the floor to you.</p> <p><i>This is preparation for the next session!!</i></p> <p><i>This is preparation for the next session!!</i></p> <p>10 minutes</p> <p>15 minutes</p> <p>20 minutes</p>
<p>Follow-up/Extension Work</p>	