July 18, 2012

Chairman Julius Genachowski  
Federal Communications Commission  
445 12th Street SW  
Washington, DC 20554

Re: Letter, CG Docket No. 09-158, CC Docket No. 98-170, WC Docket No. 04-36  

Dear Chairman Genachowski,  

Open data and an independent, transparent measurement framework must be the cornerstones of any scientifically credible broadband Internet access measurement program. The undersigned members of the academic and research communities therefore respectfully ask the Commission to remain committed to the principles of openness and transparency and to allow the scientific process to serve as the foundation of the broadband measurement program.

Measuring network performance is complex. Even among those of us who focus on this topic as our life’s work, there are disagreements. The scientific process happens best in the sunlight and that can only happen when as many eyes as possible are able to look at a shared set of data, work to replicate results, and assess its meaning and impact. This ensures the conclusions from the broadband measurement allow for meaningful, data-driven policy making.

Since the inception of the broadband measurement program, those of us who work on Internet research have lauded its precedent-setting commitment to open-data and transparency. Many of us have engaged with this program, advising on network transparency and measurement methodology and using the openly-released raw data as a part of our research.

However, we understand that some participants in the program have proposed significant changes that would transform an open measurement process into a closed one. Specifically, that the Federal Communications Commission (FCC) is considering a proposal to replace the Measurement Lab server infrastructure with closed infrastructure, run by the participating Internet service providers (ISPs) whose own speeds are being measured.

In order for the scientific process to work, measurement data must be openly available as well as access to methodologies, and explicit cataloging of assumptions is essential if results are to be confirmed and replicated. A switch from an open to a closed infrastructure makes this process impossible or, at best, questionable.

We strongly oppose any decision by the FCC to run a closed measurement program. We urge the managers of the program to reconsider any steps to run measurement tests over closed infrastructure. If expansion of the current infrastructure is needed, those wishing to provision measurement servers should be encouraged to contribute resources to the Measurement Lab Consortium. Measurement Lab is a research network, and operates its servers in a consistent, openly documented manner. This ensures comparable, credible data, and enables the research community to put our faith in the measurement results, and to stake our professional reputations
on conclusions based on the data.

Respectfully submitted,

Sascha Meinrath  
Vice President and Director  
Open Technology Institute  
New America Foundation

Vint Cerf  
Internet Pioneer  
Chief Internet Evangelist  
Google

Robert W. Taylor  
Founder  
ARPAnet  
Recipient of The National Medal of  
Technology and The National Academy of  
Engineering Draper Prize

Board of Directors  
Association of Developers and Users of Free  
Software for Administrations and Local Authorities (ADULLACT)

John Vittal  
COO  
BalanceTek Corporation  
Developer of first full email client (MSG) and email standards (RFC733)

Susan Crawford  
Professor  
Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law

Scott Shenker  
Professor of Computer Science  
Berkeley

Ronald Deibert  
Director  
The Citizen Lab  
and The Canada Centre for  
Global Security Studies  
University of Toronto

David J. Farber  
Distinguished Career Professor of Computer Science and Public Policy  
Carnegie Mellon  
Former Chief Technologist  
Federal Communications Commission

Rahul Tongia  
Adjunct Professor  
Carnegie Mellon

George Manley  
Storage Engineer  
Clemson University

Esther Dyson  
Founder  
EDventure

Rollie Cole, Ph.D., J.D.  
Founder  
Fertile Ground for Startups and Small Firms

Gene Gaines  
Founder  
Gaines Group Consulting

Eric Burger  
Director  
Center for Secure Communications  
Research Professor  
Computer Science  
Georgetown University
Ellen Witte Zegura  
Professor and Chair  
School of Computer Science  
College of Computing  
Georgia Institute of Technology

Nick Feamster  
Associate Professor  
College of Computing  
Georgia Institute of Technology

Russell Clark  
Research Scientist  
College of Computing and Computer Science  
Georgia Institute of Technology

Matt Welsh  
Staff Software Engineer  
Google

Margo Seltzer  
Herchel Smith Professor  
of Computer Science  
Harvard College Professor  
in the School of Engineering and Applied  
Sciences  
Harvard University

Harry R. Lewis  
Gordon McKay Professor  
of Computer Science  
Harvard University

David Weinberger  
Senior Researcher  
Harvard Berkman Center  
for Internet and Society

George Sadowsky  
Chair of the Nominating Committee  
at Internet Corporation for Assigned  
Names and Numbers (ICANN)  
Internet Pioneer

Mark Allman  
Computer Scientist  
International Computer Science Institute

Paul Vixie  
Chairman and Founder  
Internet Systems Consortium

The Internet Systems Consortium (ISC)

Dan Lynch  
Founder  
INTEROP  
Internet Pioneer

Hari Balakrishnan  
Fujitsu Professor of Computer Science  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Eric von Hippel  
Professor  
Engineering Systems Division  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Cliff Bamford  
Principal Architect, Internet Operations  
Microsoft (retired)

Brough Turner  
Founder and CTO  
netBlazr, Inc.

Neil Hunt  
Chief Product Officer  
Netflix
Peter Honeyman
Research Professor
of Computer Science and Engineering
University of Michigan

Steven Huter
Director
Network Startup Resource Center
University of Oregon

Henry M. Levy
Wissner-Slivka Chair
in Computer Science and Engineering
University of Washington

Edward D. Lazowska
Bill and Melinda Gates Chair
in Computer Science and Engineering
University of Washington

Tom Anderson
Robert E. Dinning Professor
of Computer Science and Engineering
University of Washington

Steven D. Gribble
Professor of Computer Science
and Engineering
University of Washington

David J. Wetherall
Professor of Computer Science
and Engineering
University of Washington

John Zahorjan
Professor of Computer Science
and Engineering
University of Washington

Arvind Krishnamurthy
Associate Professor of Computer Science
and Engineering
University of Washington

Seth Woodworth
Internet Researcher and
Digital Freedom Advocate

Cc: Commissioner Mignon Clyburn
Commissioner Robert M. McDowell
Commissioner Ajit Pai
Commissioner Jessica Rosenworcel